

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

**Minutes
2021**

April 26,

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a regular meeting on Monday, April 26, 2021 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Josh Wilber presided over the meeting with the following members present: Thomas Stark, Ken McWilliams, Mike Pittman, Jerry Wade, and Owen McCall. Also present were Brian Martin – Building Inspector, Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist, and Nicole Schell – Director of Planning.

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

3/22/2021 Minutes:

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for March 22, 2021 and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes – seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
J. Wade	Approved
T. Stark	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Lisa Riggio – C. of A. to replace wood siding on upper and lower rear addition with metal siding.
Location: **811-13 E. Second St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)
- B. Peach noted applicant Lisa Riggio has withdrawn the application.
2. Prickett – C. of A. to north side –east side – 2 new transom windows; south side – replace basement door, replace main level window with patio door.
Location: **927 W. First St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)
- B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mike Prickett was present.
- M. Prickett explained the proposed changes. K. McWilliams and M. Pittman noted the home’s noncontributing status and voiced support for the application. B. Martin did remind M. Prickett of the flood plain and required permits.
- J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Page 2
 Historic District Board
 of Review
 March 22, 2021

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Windows	60-63		<p><i>T. Stark</i> – This house is a noncontributing structure in the historic district, a replacement door and transom windows above the front door will even out the front of the house and is in accordance to the guidelines. It will be a great improvement. New porches should be consistent with the historic appearance of the building and I believe this one is. The replacement windows will be aluminum clad wood and the addition of the transom windows will be a nice addition. These are huge improvements.</p> <p><i>M. Prickett</i> – the transoms will just replace ones that I strongly believe were already there.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree with everything T. Stark said, but I am confused why this is a noncontributing structure given the construction date.</p> <p><i>B. Peach</i> – explained the reasons why a structure is deemed either contributing or noncontributing and that those designations may change depending on the work done.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I approve and agree with T. Stark.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree with O. McCall and T. Stark for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree as well.</p>
Doors and Entrances	39-42		
Porches	49-50		

J. Wilber asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Mike Prickett for the proposed additions and changes to that property.”

Seconded by T. Stark.

Roll Call:

- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- J. Wade Approved
- T. Stark Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- M. Pittman Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 3. Mike Prickett – C. of A. to build an addition on the south and west side of the home that has a concrete foundation and typical wood framing.

Location: **919 W. First St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mike Prickett was present.

Page 3
 Historic District Board
 of Review
 March 22, 2021

M. Prickett explained the proposed changes but also noted a 6/12 roof pitch change that was not included in the original application. B. Martin did remind M. Prickett of the flood plain and required permits.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction - Additions	68		<p><i>O. McCall</i> – I strongly believe this is a noncontributing structure, so in that case, the guidelines wouldn't really have much impact, but this addition will be on the rear. It will be compatible with the original house, does not imitate earlier historic style, and is in conformance with the guidelines. The roof pitch of 6/12 is appropriate.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree with <i>O. McCall</i> for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons and it's a major upgrade as a whole and does make it fit it very nicely with Madison's downtown historic district.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. *O. McCall* made the following motion, "based on the preceding findings of fact, the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Mike Prickett for the proposed rear addition and change in roof slope at 919 W. First St."

Seconded by *K. McWilliams*.

Roll Call:

- J. Wilber* Approved
- O. McCall* Approved
- J. Wade* Approved
- T. Stark* Approved
- K. McWilliams* Approved
- M. Pittman* Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 4. Michael Rawert – C. of A. to install vinyl replacement windows on sides and rear that will match the details, size, shape, and design of the existing windows.
 Location: **811-13 E. Second St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach noted applicant Michael Rawert had requested to postpone this to the May meeting.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

Page 4
 Historic District Board
 of Review
 March 22, 2021

J. Wilber asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “for the property at 811-813 E. Second St., I propose we table this application to the May meeting.”

Seconded by T. Stark

Roll Call:

T. Stark	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
J. Wade	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Wilber	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved

The motion to table the application passed. The application will be moved to the May agenda.

5. Kevin Watkins - C. of A. to add second story addition on north extent of home on rear; build steps down to front instead of side; on west – add 2 clerestory windows, single window in kitchen, and window in second floor addition; on north – remove brick chimney, add second story addition with 2 windows in facing, remove 2 windows on first floor facing; add 20’ x 26’ garage with loft (primary opening to face Poplar St. with dormer facing north) and covered catwalk between garage and rear door.

Location: **222 W. Second St.** Zoned: Residential Medium Density (R-8)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicants. Kevin Watkins was present. After a brief questioning of K. Watkins by K. McWilliams regarding a preservation covenant, N. Schell reminded K. McWilliams of his obligation to recuse himself. J. Wilber called a short six-minute recess to the meeting when K. McWilliams protested N. Schell’s reminder. K. McWilliams, J. Wilber, and N. Schell stepped out into the hall to discuss K. McWilliams’ recusal. recused himself from the discussion and vote on this application due to communication with the applicant prior to the meeting and upon the advice of Board attorney Devon Sharpe. K. Watkins expressed his desire to restore this home to reflect its catalog heritage including adding vertical trim on the horizontal clapboard to mimic the original shipped panels. He also asked to amend the application to include a reduced garage footprint of 20’x26’ instead of the original 20’ x30’ sizing. J. Wilber and T. Stark asked about height of the garage in relation to the surrounding homes. K. Watkins stated the garage would be 22’ tall, but that this is still not at tall as the surrounding two-story homes.

There was a short discussion regarding the private preservation easement and covenant agreement between K. Watkins and Historic Madison, Inc. N. Schell advised the HDBR commissioners this agreement was private and not within the purview of the Board.

J. Wade thanked K. Watkins for his thorough and thoughtful presentation and stated he truly believed the changes to be appropriate and would restore the original architectural character of the house. T. Stark asked for clarification on the porch and whether the installation of the wood railings and supports would mean the removal of the concrete porch. K. Watkins stated he would not remove the concrete but would like to install wood plank porch flooring on top of the concrete. He also noted the side entry would include a wood frame step as well.

J. Wilber asked for public comments. B. Peach noted she had received two public comments from neighbors Steve Matthews and Michelle Lappie-Fletcher and read each for the record. Each letter voiced concern about the size of the garage and parking issues. K. Watkins responded to these concerns by stating the creation of off-street parking would actually save on parking

Page 5
Historic District Board of Review
March 22, 2021

because of the fact he owns two vehicles and a boat (i.e., parking these on the street would cause more of an issue); the alterations to the garage design were to appease concerns.

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Chimneys	38		<i>M. Pittman</i> – The chimney is not original. The garage location at the rear meets the guidelines. He has a two-story house, so the construction of a two-story house is allowed by the ordinance. It is in keeping with the character of the neighborhood. He is using aluminum clad wood windows which meet guidelines. The new windows will meet the character of the home and are also in conformance. The restoration of the original porch will be much better and is appropriate to the style of home and age. The addition will match the characteristics of the home and neighborhood will be a benefit to the area. Doors and entrances again are important and these proposed changes are appropriate.
Garages and Outbuildings	45		<i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
Windows	60-63		<i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
Porch	51-52		<i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
Columns & Railings			<i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
New Construction – Additions	68		<i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
Doors and Entrances	39-42		

J. Wilber asked for a motion. *T. Stark* made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison HDBR grant a COA to *Kevin Watkins* to add a second story addition on the north elevation, to build steps to the front of the porch instead of the side, to add two clerestory window to the west side, add one single window on the west side in the kitchen, add a French door to replace the two dining room windows on the west side, add two double-hung windows on the addition on the north side and one on the east, remove the rear chimney, remove the two north facing windows in the old rear addition, build a 20’x26’ garage with loft facing Poplar Street and dormer facing the north, and build a covered walkway between the garage and the rear of the home at 222 W. Second St.”

Motion was seconded *M. Pittman*.

Roll Call:

T. Stark Approved
O. McCall Approved
J. Vernon Approved
K. McWilliams Recused/Abstained
M. Pittman Approved
J. Wilber Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

6. *McGillan Holdings / Justin McGillan* – *C. of A.* to remove small 24” windows on the west side and install overhead doors in the basement level on the north end and middle event and serving area.
 Location: **801 E. Main St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicants and explained the changes proposed by the applicants. Rodney Pettit from Pettit Group was present.

Page 7
Historic District Board of Review
March 22, 2021

R. Pettit stated the home currently has all vinyl windows and modern doors. T. Stark asked if the applicants would consider using aluminum clad or metal sliding glass doors. R. Pettit stated they would consider it but that the cost of such doors would be prohibitive to this project and stated this is a noncontributing structure. J. Wade asked what the cost differences were between vinyl and aluminum clad. R. Pettit stated aluminum clad products were typically three to four times higher if not more.

B. Martin reminded the Board and R. Pettit of the flood zone issues and necessary permits.

R. Pettit asked to amend the application to include a roof covering of the back deck. J. Wilber stated since there is no drawing or plan, it would be hard to approve. N. Schell stated the Board could partially approve the application and extend the remaining portion and hear it next month, giving R. Pettit time to submit a plan for a roof covering.

J. Wilber asked for any questions from the Board or for public comment. He noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet		
Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commentary Guideline Page #
Decks	64	
Doors & Entrances	39-42	<p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – Decks on the side are acceptable by the guidelines. The doors do not conform to the guidelines, but this is a noncontributing structure and it currently has vinyl as do most of the houses along that street.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – Agree for same reasons.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I disagree because vinyl is specifically prohibited by the guidelines.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – Agree.</p> <p><i>T. Stark</i> – Disagree. If we could get some concession the door material, I would agree, but this house is very visible and if we have the chance to improve those openings, I'd like to see the owner step up to meet the guidelines.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – Although what O. McCall and T. Stark stated is true, there is already vinyl there and we've allowed that in our guidelines because of the existing material. Only for that reason, I agree.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, "I move that we approve the proposed deck and doors at 901 W. First St. as a partial approval and request the applicant come back at the next meeting with the proposed roof changes."

Motion was seconded K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

- T. Stark Denied
- O. McCall Denied
- J. Wade Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

**Page 10
Historic District Board of Review
March 22, 2021**

10. Chris and Gina Lynn / Brian Martin – C. of A. to add a surround at the front door (214) and build a new garage at the rear of the property. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)
Location: **216-14 W. Second St.**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicants and explained the changes proposed by the applicants. Brian Martin was present. K. McWilliams asked about the orientation of the garage doors. B. Martin noted the doors would be aimed north and explained the overall design of the garage. He also explained the design and rationale for the surround at 214. T. Stark stated because the property was originally built as a duplex, he feared adding the surround would alter that character. B. Martin explained the homeowners want to keep as much of the original character as possible and that this was their one proposed change in order to distinguish the primary entrance.

J. Wilber asked for any questions from the Board or for public comment. Chris Harper, a neighbor at 212 W. Second St., stated it was a picture of his front door that was shown as an example of what the applicants wanted. C. Harper stated when he had previously appeared before the HDBR, he showed a picture of a neighbor’s doors as an example and was told he needed an original drawing. He stated 208 and 210 were also duplexes and he was confused as to what the exact nature of the proposed project of the surround was. B. Martin stated the doorway would not be modified, but the surround simply added without sidelights. C. Harper asked if the garage was attached or detached and would include an apartment that would be rented out. B. Martin stated it was detached and the apartment space in the garage would not be used for rental space but rather an extension of the main home.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Architectural Feature	31-33		<p><i>O. McCall</i> – The surround meets the guidelines and is appropriate to the home. These infill buildings should be compatible in terms of height, massing, scale, and setbacks. This garage does and in fact they are taking pains to make sure it is a reduced footprint. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree with <i>O. McCall</i> for the same reasons. <i>J. Wade</i> – I would rather see an accurate drawing not an inspiration photo. It does nothing but cause confusion. But, I do approve for the same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I approve for the same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I, too, agree for the same reasons.</p>
Garages & Outbuildings	45		
New Construction – Infill Buildings	69-71		

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison HDBR grant a COA to Chris and Gina Lynn for the proposed surround of the front door and new construction infill building garage to be added to the rear of the home located at 216-14 W. Second St.”

Motion was seconded K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

T. Stark Approved

O. McCall Approved

J. Wade Approved
 K. McWilliams Approved
 M. Pittman Approved
Page 11
Historic District Board of Review
March 22, 2021
 J. Wilber Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

J. Wilber stated the COA was approved and the applicant could go ahead with the project pending the requisite permits were filed.

11. Bill and Patti Johann – C. of A. to build a 10’x10’ wood outbuilding and 10’x8’ deck in the backyard.
 Location: **520 W. Second St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicants and explained the changes proposed by the applicants. Bill Johann was present.

J. Wilber asked for any questions from the Board or for public comment. He noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Decks	64		<i>K. McWilliams</i> – Decks are acceptable in the back and this one is. New buildings should be compatible and this project meets all of those guidelines.
Garages and Outbuildings	45		<i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>O. McCall</i> – I approve for the same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wade</i> – I agree. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I, too, agree for the same reasons.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. T. Stark made the following motion, “based on the preceding findings of fact, the Madison HDDBR grant a COA to Bill and Patti Johann for the proposed 10’x10’ wood outbuilding and the 10’x8’ wood deck to be added to the rear of the home located at 520 W. Second St.”

Motion was seconded O. McCall.

Roll Call:

T. Stark Approved
 O. McCall Approved
 J. Vernon Approved
 K. McWilliams Approved
 M. Pittman Approved
 J. Wilber Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

J. Wilber stated the COA was approved and the applicant could go ahead with the project pending the requisite permits were filed.

**Page 12
Historic District Board of Review
March 22, 2021**

J. Wilber stated the COA was approved and the applicant could go ahead with the project pending the requisite permits were filed.

Old Business:

J. Wilber noted there was no old business from the Board.

New Business:

J. Wilber noted there was no new business from the Board.

Staff Report:

Historic District Board of Review: Fast Track Applications			
Applicant	Address	Date of Approval	Material & Project
Cathy Hale	1212 W. Second St.	03/25/2021	Aluminum clad windows; Hardie board siding; Aluminum clad door
FastSigns of Louisville	1001 W. Second St.	3/25/2021	Cast aluminum sign letters
Charles F. Requet, III	735 Jefferson St.	3/30/2021	LP Smartsiding; Aluminum clad windows
McGillan Holdings	801 E. Main St.	3/31/2021	LP Smartsiding; Aluminum clad windows; Fiberglass entry doors; Cornado stone resurface (basement area); remove window awnings
McGillan Holdings	801 E. Main St.	4/7/2021	Exterior lighting
Jerry Taylor	700 Cragmont St.	4/13/2021	Removal of unsafe brick veneer; Metal siding
Tony & Lisa Hammock	917-19 W. Main St.	4/15/2021	Garage – LP Smartsiding
Betty Todd	745 ½ W. Third St.	4/19/2021	Front Door – wood w/ oval glass insert (historic door)

Historic District Board of Review: April 2020 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Mark Cady	801 E. Main St.	replace doors with fiberglass doors. Replace windows with aluminum clad windows	Not Done

Phillip & Kitty Smith	306 Jefferson St.	remove collapsed portion of rear brick wall. Remove existing rear windows and door. Replace collapsed brick with framed wall and vinyl siding. Install 4 new vinyl windows and 1 wood door	In Progress – Everything except siding has been completed to COA specifications
David Powell	316 Walnut	enclose side porch with Hardieboard siding and install iron railing to front steps	Completed to COA Specifications
Sherry Eblen	612 E. Main St.	replace wood window on rear with a metal and glass door and install a concrete patio and steps with iron railing	Completed to COA Specifications

Historic District Board of Review: April 2021 Violations

Owner	Address	Violation	Action Taken
Van Crafton	306 Broadway St.	Removal of shutters; wooden basement window infill	1. Letter sent 2/18/2021 2. Email sent 4/19/2021
Rebecca Keating	304 Broadway St.	Removal of shutters; wooden basement window infill	1. Letter sent 2/18/2021 2. Email sent 4/19/2021

K. McWilliams made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by T. Stark.

Meeting adjourned at 7:59p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW



Josh Wilber, Chair



Brooke Peach
Historic Preservationist