

**HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW**

**Minutes**

**July 26, 2021**

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a regular meeting on Monday, July 26, 2021 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Thomas Stark presided over the meeting with the following members present: Josh Wilber, Thomas Stark, Mike Pittman, Jerry Wade, Jerome Vernon, and Owen McCall. Also present were Scott Gross – Building Inspector, Devon Sharpe – City Attorney, and Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

**5/26/2021 Minutes:**

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for May 26, 2021 and had any corrections or additions.

T. Stark moved to approve the minutes – seconded by O. McCall.

**Roll Call:**

J. Vernon                    Approved

O. McCall                    Approved

J. Wade                    Approved

T. Stark                      Approved

J. Wilber                    Approved

M. Pittman                  Abstain

***Minutes stand approved.***

**6/28/2021 Minutes:**

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for June 28, 2021 and had any corrections or additions.

O. McCall moved to approve the minutes – seconded by T. Stark.

**Roll Call:**

J. Vernon                    Abstain

O. McCall                    Approved

J. Wade                    Approved

T. Stark                      Approved

J. Wilber                    Abstain

M. Pittman                  Abstain

***Minutes stand approved.***

Page 2  
**Historic District Board of Review**  
**July 26, 2021**

**Applications:**

1. John Schuring – C. of A. to: remove the existing deck on the north side of home and rebuild a new deck increasing the size to 10’x14’ with a gabled roof and screen exterior.  
 Location: **621 Presbyterian Ave.**      Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. S. Gross was present to represent J. Schuring.

M. Pittman, J. Wilber, and J. Vernon asked if stairs were included and S. Gross replied no. T. Stark asked if the gable would drop under the original roofline and S. Gross replied it would. J. Wilber verified materials.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

**Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet**

<b>Building Element</b>	<b>Residential Guideline Page #</b>	<b>Commercial Guideline Page #</b>	<b>Discussion</b>
New Construction - Decks	64		<i>O. McCall</i> – Decks should be located on the rear of the building, of simple design, and made of wood, so it seems to be in conformance to the guidelines. <i>J. Vernon</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to John Schuring for the proposed removal of the existing deck and it’s replacement for the larger one with a gable roof and screened exterior 14’x10’ at the rear of the home on 621 Presbyterian Ave.”

Seconded by T. Stark.

**Roll Call:**

- J. Wilber                      Approved
- O. McCall                    Approved
- J. Wade                    Approved
- T. Stark                        Approved
- J. Vernon                     Approved
- M. Pittman                    Approved

***The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.***

2. Mark Viterna – C. of A. to: build single car garage at rear of home (off Presbyterian Ave.) to be 14’x34’ with Hardie board siding (7” reveal) to match home, 4/12 pitch roof with shingle, 13’ high walls, 9’ overhead garage door, 14’x16’ driveway, and white vinyl gutters to match home.  
 Location: **716 W. Third St.**      Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mark Viterna was present.

**Page 3**  
**Historic District Board of Review**  
**July 26, 2021**

M. Viterna added height was 13’ on walls and about 15’ peak. There was discussions about set-backs and M. Viterna verified he’d received approvals for set-backs from an earlier BZA meeting.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

**Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet**

<b>Building Element</b>	<b>Residential Guideline Page #</b>	<b>Commercial Guideline Page #</b>	<b>Discussion</b>
New Construction – Infill	69-71		<p><i>M. Pittman</i> – New buildings should be compatible in terms of materials, size, set-back, scale, roof form, and oriented to the major street and it is.</p> <p><i>J. Vernon</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. T. Stark made the following motion, “based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Mark Viterna for the proposed building of a garage at the rear of the property that will be 14’ x34’, sided with Hardie board to match the house, a 4/12 pitch with composition shingle to match the house, 9’ garage door, 14’ x16’ driveway, and vinyl gutters to match the house located at 716 W. Third St.”

Seconded by M. Pittman.

**Roll Call:**

- J. Vernon                                Approved
- O. McCall                               Approved
- J. Wade                                Approved
- T. Stark                                    Approved
- J. Wilber                                 Approved
- M. Pittman                               Approved

***The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.***

- 3.** Steve Buchanan – C. of A. to: raise existing walls to accommodate 3/12 pitch and add four egress windows to code.  
 Location: **713-15 W. Main St.**                                Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Steve Buchanan was present.

S. Buchanan stated he intended to do the original plans but found an issue with cracked floor joists due to improper load issues of the existing dormer. We moved the new dormer to the exterior walls and raised it from a 1/12 to a 3/12 pitch to accommodate higher walls. J. Wilber asked for clarification. S. Buchanan said the ceiling would’ve been too short without him adding the wall height and pitch. O. McCall asked what raising the walls had to do with load bearing

Page 4  
 Historic District Board  
 of Review  
 July 26, 2021

issues. S. Buchanan stated he changed the pitch and wall height so that people could walk all the way to the side wall; without the change, the wall would've been about 4'.

J. Wilber asked why S. Buchanan did not stop when he noted the problems and knew he had to change the design significantly in order to obtain the proper HDBR approvals. S. Buchanan stated the roof was completely off, so he had to do something to protect the house. S. Buchanan stated he spoke with former building inspector Brian Martin at the site about the reasons for the change in design. J. Vernon asked if the building permit had been amended. S. Buchanan stated it had not. J. Wilber asked if the joists had been changed to alleviate load issues and S. Buchanan stated they had. O. McCall then asked why if the load issues had been resolved did he change the design. S. Buchanan stated he felt he had no other choice for safety reasons. T. Stark stated the changes S. Buchanan made could make the structure non-contributing.

J. Wade asked S. Buchanan if he could put it back like it was. S. Buchanan stated it could possibly be. T. Stark noted the chimney now is no longer a prominent feature.

S. Buchanan again stated B. Martin was aware of the changes and the reason for the changes. T. Stark asked S. Gross if he and B. Martin ever discussed the Buchanan project. S. Gross replied no. S. Gross stated he verified the old broken floor joists. M. Pittman stated his support of S. Buchanan's experience.

J. Wilber asked D. Sharpe if an affidavit from B. Martin would be necessary. D. Sharpe advised it would be a good idea. J. Wilber asked S. Buchanan if he would be willing to defer the application to the next meeting and Buchanan agreed. M. Pittman asked to have a special session instead as soon as the affidavit is received.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, "I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review table this application until we get an affidavit from Brian Martin and call a special session per the guidelines and vote on this."

Seconded by J. Wilber.

**Roll Call:**

J. Vernon            Abstain

O. McCall            Deny

J. Wade            Abstain

T. Stark                Deny

M. Pittman            Approved

J. Wilber              Approved

***The motion to approve the extend the application until a special session may be called passed.***

Page 6  
 Historic District Board of Review  
 July 26, 2021

**Old Business:**

J. Wilber noted there was no old business from the Board.

**New Business:**

B. Peach read Nicole Schell’s HDBR Report.

J. Wilber and Board discussed COA notification letters and the pros and cons of requiring the letters due to the high cost. O. McCall suggested the signs be posted on each right-of-way. Also discussed was to require applicants to post a copy of their COA in a conspicuous place for the duration of an approved project. Camille Fife spoke to support the display of signs over certified notification letters and posting COAs for the duration of a project.

**Staff Report:**

Historic District Board of Review: July 2020 Review			
Applicant	Address	COA	Completed to COA
<b>Howard &amp; Lisa Cutshall</b>	624 W. Second St.	Build rear addition	No
<b>Betty and Ira Todd</b>	745 ½ W. Third St.	replace front (north) porch with a shed style roof. Install awning over east side door. Replace aluminum siding with vinyl siding	Yes
<b>John and Mary Ellen Bargerhuff</b>	619 W. Main St.	build a 34-ft x 26-ft two car garage with attached carport	Yes

Historic District Board of Review: Fast Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
<b>Todd Boone / Catherine Evans</b>	107 E. Second St.	Install painted sign on west side of Boone’s building
<b>Arnold &amp; Karen Conaway</b>	109 E. Main St.	Install aluminum window to match the design, shape, & size of existing industrial window on front upper façade

J. Wilber made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by M. Pittman.

Meeting adjourned at 6:59 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW



Josh Wilber, Chair



Brooke Peach  
 Historic Preservationist