

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

August 23, 2021

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a regular meeting on Monday, August 23, 2021 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Thomas Stark presided over the meeting with the following members present: Josh Wilber, Thomas Stark, Mike Pittman, Jerome Vernon, and Owen McCall. Also present was Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

7/26/2021 and 8/10/2021 Minutes:

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for July 26 and August 10, 2021 and had any corrections or additions.

O. McCall moved to approve the minutes – seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

J. Vernon Approved

O. McCall Approved

T. Stark Approved

J. Wilber Approved

M. Pittman Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. **Jim Pruett** – C. of A. to: install 6/6 vinyl windows & shutters with dogs.
Location: **307 Jefferson St.** Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. J. Pruett was present.

J. Pruett stated the windows were not original and replacements from circa 1940s in his opinion. He noted he wanted to add shutters because there was evidence of shutters at one time and that he wanted to add removal and replacement of the lintels to the application. Also, he stated he owned several buildings in this same row, one having vinyl windows currently, and he wanted them all to have a uniform look.

T. Stark asked if there was evidence of shutters historically and J. Pruett stated there was evidence of dogs having been installed on the front façade. J. Pruett also stated he'd received approval for shutters on 306 Jefferson.

J. Wilber asked for the rationale for vinyl windows. J. Pruett stated the windows were a very good quality being \$1250 each installed and it fit his budget. M. Pittman clarified and J. Pruett agreed these were the same windows as were approved in 2012 on 123 Central Ave. O. McCall stated the existing windows did not appear to be 80% or more deteriorated and asked why J. Pruett could not repair the windows. J. Pruett stated he wanted 6/6 windows. J. Wilber asked if the windows worked and J. Pruett stated maybe but he wasn't sure. J. Vernon clarified the vinyl window option was a personal selection and asked if J. Pruett had applied for a PACE grant. J. Pruett stated he had and it was approved for the proposed windows. J. Pruett admitted he did not state specifically the window material for the PACE application.

Page 2
 Historic District Board of Review
 August 23, 2021

J. Wilber asked J. Pruett what the front door would look like. J. Pruett stated it was a commercial door similar to the front doors at City Hall. B. Peach noted the doors had already been staff approved.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Windows		56-59	<p><i>M. Pittman</i> – They will be wood shutters and there is evidence of their historically being shutters there, so they do conform to the guidelines on page 55. If you look at the guidelines on pages 56-59 for windows, the guidelines do not favor vinyl but as they were written in 2009 and he used these windows in his own home on Central Ave. Our guidelines favor wood or aluminum clad, but I believe his proposed window does meet the guidelines.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – The guidelines also say the existing windows must be at least 80% deteriorated and from the street, they look like they are not. Those windows can be repaired as specified in the door. I disagree and do not think the windows meet guidelines, but even though traditionally businesses didn't have shutters, this building shows evidence of shutters. Given that evidence, I agree the shutters are in conformance.</p> <p><i>J. Vernon</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I understand the desire to keep consistency among this group of buildings. This board has approved some vinyl in the past, but we have been fairly consistent with not approving them on the front. This is a very prominent central area. I'm inclined to disagree that the windows should not be approved. The shutters are fine.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for same reasons.</p> <p><i>T. Stark</i> – I disagree. We have been consistent with both residential and commercial and we need to keep that consistency especially on front façade windows. The guidelines strictly say no vinyl and that's where I get hung up.</p>
Shutters	55		

J. Wilber asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, "I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA for the project at 310 Jefferson St. with vinyl windows, but he will check out aluminum clad windows, and the shutters."

Seconded by J. Wilber

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Denied

O. McCall Denied

T. Stark Denied

J. Vernon Denied

M. Pittman Approved

Page 4
Historic District Board of Review
August 23, 2021

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction – Decks	64		<p><i>J. Vernon</i> – This project meets all the guidelines because it will be in the back of the home, the grill will be screened, and the materials are in conformance.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. I think the pony wall helps to screen it from the street.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to John and Lisa Gray to add a cover over the existing patio composed of wood, asphalt shingles, stone, and Hardie board and located at 736 W. Main St.”

Seconded by T. Stark.

Roll Call:

J. Vernon Approved

O. McCall Approved

J. Wade Approved

T. Stark Approved

J. Wilber Approved

M. Pittman Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Michael McClellan – C. of A. to: install an aluminum carport 20’x21x7’ in place of existing smaller aluminum carport.
Location: **208 Ferry St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Michael McClellan was present.

There were no questions from the Board.

J. Wilber asked for public comments and noted there were none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction – Infill Buildings	69-71		<p><i>T. Stark</i> – New buildings should be compatible in terms of height and this is. Setbacks are appropriate and meets the guidelines. Although this garage is a bit larger, it will fit nicely and conform to spacing and massing. The roof shape conforms.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p>

Page 5
Historic District Board of Review
August 23, 2021

			<i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Vernon</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
--	--	--	--

J. Wilber asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, “I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Michael McClellan to replace the existing metal carport, increase the size, and install a new metal 20’x21’x7’ carport.”

Seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

J. Vernon	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
T. Stark	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
J. Wilber	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- Judith Koehler** – C. of A. to: build a capital above the front door.
 Location: **613 Mulberry St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Judith Koehler was present.

O. McCall asked what type of material J. Koehler would use and she responded something akin to Versatex. J. Wilber asked B. Peach to explain the material. B. Peach stated the product had been used for historic preservation projects in other cities and received approval from those municipalities.

O. McCall asked if there was evidence of this home having such a capital. J. Koehler stated not to her knowledge but that many other homes of similar architectural style around town had the same types of capitals above the front doors.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Architectural Features	33-34		<i>O. McCall</i> – Seeing as this material has been approved by other boards and the capital is appropriate to the architectural style of the home, the entire project meets the guidelines. <i>J. Vernon</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wade</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Judith Koehler for the proposed capital above the front door at 613 Mulberry Street.”

Seconded by T. Stark.

Page 6
Historic District Board of Review
August 23, 2021

Roll Call:

J. Vernon Approved
O. McCall Approved
T. Stark Approved
M. Pittman Approved
J. Wilber Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Old Business:

J. Wilber noted there was no old business from the Board.

New Business:

J. Wilber and Board discussed COA certified letter notifications and requiring posting of COAs for the duration of a project. T. Stark read Board notes. M. Pittman stated a person in the historic district must obtain a COA in order to get a building permit, so in his opinion it was not necessary. M. Pittman further said the state notifications of applications is similar to how Madison advertises COA applications by listing on the website, in the newspaper, signage at the property, and on the legal notice here at City Hall. J. Wilber noted the newspaper also published a digital addition.

Link Ludington stated he did not believe the local ordinance allowed the HDBR to make these changes without the approval from the Council and an ordinance change. He stated such changes had been attempted by many HDBRs since the late 1980s despite the HDBR can only regulate their own business in a meeting according to the ordinance. L. Ludington urged a comprehensive review of the ordinance to make it conform to the state enabling legislation.

J. Wilber stated after speaking with Mayor Courtney, the administration would like to update the survey, the ordinance, and the design guidelines in an appropriate manner and order. He also stated there was previous groundwork that can be used, but it all needs to be done in the correct way and order.

Staff Report:

August 2021 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Jeff Kennard/ Chris Heitz	709 W. Main St.	Remove existing Crystal & Jules signage; fabricate & install new neon sign w/ vintage look
Mark Viterna	923 W. Main St.	Replace 4 front vinyl 1 / 1 windows w/ Quaker aluminum clad wood 1 / 1 windows
Rick & Cathy Taylor	1010 W. Main St.	Replace picture window on southern façade w/ 2/2 aluminum clad wood window to match historic opening; replace full light front door w/ original historic wood & glass door
Hayley Holycross &	765 W. Third St.	Replace front door w/ 6 pane top-light door; replace vinyl siding w/ Hardie

Page 7
 Historic District Board of Review
 August 23, 2021

Zackery Nicholson		board siding; replace front windows (if they cannot be restored) w/ wood or aluminum clad of same size & design; replace gutters w/ new of similar design
John & Erin Ledermann	1109 W. Main St.	Replace vinyl siding w/ wood siding; replace front door w/ period & design appropriate wood door & wood screen door; uncover transom above rear door; replace front picture windows w/ new aluminum bond picture windows
Al-Denhagen, LLC	223 W. First St.	Replace existing casement wood windows on south & southeast sides of home w/ wood or aluminum clad wood windows of same design, shape, & size
Angela & Phillip Lobb	213 Jefferson St.	Install iron fencing along west back alley & retainer wall (40'x3')
Koko Heath/Hillary Steinhardt	324 Mulberry St.	Install 36"x27" sign centered above the front door which will be flat off the building w/ a black metal brace; two 12" painted (w/ gold leaf details) signs on front windows (1 each)
Kathleen Chambers	317 Mill St.	Replace front wooden porch steps w/ antique brick porch steps
Chad Gray	928 Park Ave.	Re-open closed entrance doors on East side to create 2 egress/ingress doors to meet state fire code

August 2020 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completed to COA
Lisa Riggio	704 West St.	DENIED - Install vinyl/Fibrex windows	Yes
Sharon Caggiano	102 Sering St.	DENIED - Install vinyl/Fibercore windows	Yes
Wade Investment Partners 301, LLC	301 West St.	Install new steel door behind metal sliding door. Add new door opening underneath of a window on the patio with steel door to match others on the structure.	Yes

M. Pittman made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by J. Wilber.

Meeting adjourned at 6:44 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Josh Wilber, Chair

Brooke Peach
 Historic Preservationist