

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW**Minutes**

August 22, 2022

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a regular meeting on Monday, August 22, 2022 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Thomas Stark presided over the meeting with the following members present: Owen McCall, Sandy Palmer, Carol Ann Rogers, and Mike Pittman. Also present was Nicole Schell – Director of Planning and Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

T. Stark gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. T. Stark added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

7/25/2022 Minutes:

T. Stark asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for July 25, 2022 and had any corrections or additions.

M. Pittman moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
T. Stark	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved

Minutes stand approved.**Applications:**

1. Scott Axline – C. of A. to replace existing upper floor octagon window and wood infill with a vinyl window to match those installed on the rest of the home.
Location: **214 E. Third St.** Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

No representative for the application appeared after multiple callings of the application. Application deemed incomplete and moved to September agenda.

2. Steven & Elizabeth Thomas – C. of A. to replace windows of varying material with 6/6 or 2/2 fiberglass windows of the same size.
Location: **208 E. Second St.** Zoned: **Central Business District (CBD)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Steven Thomas was present.

S. Thomas explained through research, they'd uncovered the age of the structure to be c. 1850 and noted other structures of that age to have 6/6 windows. Earlier pictures also show 6/6 windows. O. McCall asked about the Italianate classification of the home and whether 2/2 would be more appropriate. B. Peach stated 2/2 is more appropriate for Italianate whereas 6/6 would be more appropriate to the c. 1850 dating and stated the NHL listed the property as Italianate but disputed that classification.

S. Palmer noted the neighboring building had 6/6 windows. T. Stark asked B. Peach if those were original or replacement. B. Peach stated she had not evaluated those windows and did not wish to provide conjecture. M. Pittman stated either 2/2 or 6/6 would be appropriate.

Page 2
 Historic District Board of Review
 August 22, 2022

T. Stark asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Windows	68		<i>O. McCall</i> – The existing windows are either not original or extremely deteriorated and do need to be replaced. The project is in conformance. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

T. Stark asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Steven and Elizabeth Thomas to install replacement 2/2 or 6/6 fiberglass windows of the same size at 208 E. Second St.”

Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

- T. Stark Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Michael O’Dea – C. of A. to rearrange 8 existing windows on south elevation, adding 2 new windows; adjust deck/rail to new window orientation; install board & batten siding (composite) over existing brick veneer in vicinity of windows.
 Location: **803 Filmore St.** Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Michael O’Dea was present.

M. O’Dea stated he was using the existing windows, but simply adding the two additional and reconfiguring the window placement. O. McCall asked what material the new windows would be constructed of and M. O’Dea stated aluminum clad.

T. Stark asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Porch Columns & Railings Siding			<i>M. Pittman</i> – The railings will match the existing material of the current railings, the new windows are made of aluminum clad and will also match the existing windows, and the new siding is Hardie board, so the materials are in conformance. The new

Page 3
Historic District Board of Review
August 22, 2022

Windows		windows will be on the rear of the home, so that too is in conformance. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree. <i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.
---------	--	--

T. Stark asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Michael O’Dea for the project as submitted.”

Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

- T. Stark Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 4. Linda Malloy – C. of A. to add a roof over existing patio.
 Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**
 Location: **816 W. Second St.**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Kevin and Linda Malloy were present.

S. Palmer asked if the patio roof would be visible from any public right of way and K. Malloy explained that it would be visible from the alleys.

T. Stark asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction – Additions	68		<p><i>C. Rogers</i> – New additions should be located on the rear and this is. It will be of a compatible design and have the same roof shape and materials. Additions shouldn’t imitate earlier styles and should reflect current design characteristics, and this does. And, it avoids extensive damage to the historic materials if it’s removed in the future and this does. The porch guidelines don’t address adding on a new porch, but the entire project is in conformance with the additions guidelines. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I also agree. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p>

T. Stark asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Linda and Kevin Malloy to add a roof over their existing patio at 816 W. Second St.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

T. Stark Approved
 M. Pittman Approved
 O. McCall Approved
 S. Palmer Approved
 C. Rogers Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

5. Lucy Datillo – C. of A. to build a new residential structure on the site of the former residence.

Location: **1093 W. Main St.**

Zoned: **Residential Medium Density (R-8)**

No representative for the application appeared after multiple callings of the application. Application deemed incomplete and moved to September agenda.

6. Chad Gray – C. of A. to construct a 20’ awning extending rear roof that will be attached to existing rear structure of home.

Location: **124 East St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Chad Gray was present.

C. Gray stated the patio would be 16’x20’ to be the same width of the home. T. Stark asked if the roofline would be the same and C. Gray stated it would.

T. Stark asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction – Additions	68		S. Palmer – The first few guidelines deal with design, placement, and setback and this addition is in conformance. The project is in compliance with the remaining applicable guidelines. T. Stark – I agree for the same reasons. C. Rogers – I agree for the same reasons. M. Pittman – I agree for the same reasons. O. McCall – I agree for the same reasons.

T. Stark asked for a motion. C. Rogers made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Chad Gray at 124 East St. to construct a 20’ awning extending the rear roof extending the structure.”

Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

T. Stark Approved

Page 5
 Historic District Board of Review
 August 22, 2022

- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 7. Paul & Teresa Walters – C. of A. to a one-car garage on back of property to be 15’x20’; siding w/ LP smart siding, shingle roof, period appropriate 1 side door & 1 window.
 Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**
 Location: **618 E. Second St.**
- B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Paul & Teresa Walters were present.
- C. Rogers and O. McCall asked if there was an existing garage. P. Walters explained there was not, but there was a new concrete pad at the rear of the home that adjoins to the existing concrete patio.
- T. Stark asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction – Infill Buildings			<p><i>O. McCall</i> – New buildings should be compatible in terms of materials, heights, and setbacks. These are in conformance. It should also be compatible in terms of roof form and orientation to the alley. This project is consistent with the guidelines.</p> <p><i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i>– I agree for the same reasons.</p>

T. Stark asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to build a garage and small overhang at their home as submitted.”

Seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

- T. Stark Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Page 6
Historic District Board of Review
August 22, 2022

8. Mark Viterna – C. of A. to modify existing approved COA for garage to include changes in materials and structural construction. Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**
 Location: **716 W. Third St.**
- B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mark Viterna was present.
- S. Palmer and O. McCall asked M. Viterna which specific metal roof he was proposing to use. M. Viterna stated he would prefer the concealed style exposed fastener roof with 12-16” rib spacing and a rib height that is closer to standing seam but that his primary concern was not a specific roof type but rather something that would not require the additional structural elements required by standing seam. N. Schell clarified that even though the roof is classified as exposed fastener, the fasteners are hidden.
- T. Stark asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
New Construction – Infill Buildings			<i>M. Pittman</i> – New buildings should be compatible in terms of materials, set-backs, roof form, and orientation is in conformance. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>T. Stark</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

T. Stark asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Mark Viterna at 716 W. Third St. for the proposed change in roofing materials to be an exposed fastener metal roof with rib spacing of 12-16” and a rib height between ½-1”, wooden garage door, and one aluminum clad 32”x48” window on each gable peak.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

- T. Stark Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Old/New Business:

Design Guidelines Vote

T. Stark asked for any comments from the Board, received none, and noted public comment had been previously received.

M. Pittman made the following motion, “I move the Madison HDBR refer the updated Design Guidelines to the City Council for adoption.”

Page 7
 Historic District Board of Review
 August 22, 2022

Seconded by T. Stark.

Roll Call:

- T. Stark Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to refer the updated Design Guidelines and recommend their approval by the City Council passed.

O. McCall requested the Department of Planning, Preservation, and Design provide a list of any properties that have been declared unsafe, blighted, or may be slated for demolition within the historic district each month. N. Schell stated the building inspector and code enforcement officer are working on a list of such properties and that she would get them the information.

T. Stark asked about the ordinance update process. N. Schell stated she and B. Peach had drafted recommended revisions and that those had gone through a legal review and were currently being reviewed by the Mayor.

Staff Report:

August 2022 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Wayne & Elyse Detmer	104 E. Third St.	Replace existing modern standing seam metal roof with an asphalt shingle roof to more closely align with the historic 1886 roof material (as evidenced on the Sanborn Map of same year)
Heitz Sign Company	209 W. Main St.	Install one hanging sign 36"x48"x1/4" made of polymetal with vinyl graphics and one vinyl window decal of business logo 27.5"x45.5"
Lynn & Michele Pennington	227 W. Main St.	Install 4'x4' wooden hanging sign at right angle to building and one vinyl window sign 38"x23"
Catherine Burress	410 W. Second St.	Replace existing rear wood privacy fence with

Page 9
 Historic District Board of Review
 July 25, 2022

		a new 6' tall privacy fence in the same location
Sandra Bailey	736 W. Third St.	Install wooden louvered shutters on the windows


July 2021 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
John Shuring	621 Presbyterian Ave.	remove the existing deck on the north side of home and rebuild a new deck increasing the size to 10'x14' with a gabled roof and screen exterior	Yes
Mark Viterna	716 W. Third St.	build single car garage at rear of home (off Presbyterian Ave.) to be 14'x34' with Hardie board siding (7" reveal) to match home, 4/12 pitch roof with shingle, 13' high walls, 9' overhead garage door, 14'x16' driveway, and white vinyl gutters to match home	In Progress
Steve Buchanan	713-15 W. Main St.	raise existing walls to accommodate 3/12 pitch and add four egress windows to code	Yes

M. Pitman made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by T. Stark.

Meeting adjourned at 7:22 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW


 Josh Wilber, Chair

Brooke Peach
 Historic Preservationist