

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

August 25, 2025

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the regularly scheduled meeting on Monday, August 23, 2025, at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. William Jewell presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams, Ryan Rodgers, Chris Cody, and Jed Skillman. Also present was Brenna Haley – Historic Preservationist. Happy Smith and Jared Anderson were absent.

W. Jewell gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Haley will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. W. Jewell added that at the end of each application, the board will vote.

07/28/2025 Minutes:

W. Jewell asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on July 28, 2025, and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by R. Rodgers.

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
C. Cody	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

- Tom McPherson – C. of A. to remove the rear addition and replace with a 8x16' deck, extend the front porch across entire building front with steps on the side, extend roof to cover the deck, add French doors on side and back of building, and enlarge the front window.
Location: 123 Jefferson St. Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Haley explained that the applicants requested to table to application until after the next BZA meeting to discuss the apartments, as there were concerns that the proposed riverfront apartments would affect the view that would be attained with the additions proposed.

W. Jewell asked for a motion to table the application. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move we table the project at 123 Jefferson until the next meeting."

Seconded J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved

The motion to table the application was approved.

2. Rodney Pettit - C. of A. to remove the chimney.
Location: 723-725 W. Third St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Rodney Pettit was present. B. Haley noted that the work had already been completed.

R. Rodgers asked if they had been removed all the way down to the basement. R. Pettit confirmed they had been. He said that it didn't show in the pictures, but the chimney was leaning pretty badly, and he felt that it was unsafe.

C. Cody asked if the roof pitch had changed when they replaced the roof. R. Pettit said it had not. C. Cody asked if the chimney was capped, to which R. Pettit said it was just a metal cap. C. Cody also asked how tall the chimney was and how many brick courses it had at the top. R. Pettit said it was roughly 4 feet tall, and 2 courses were at the top.

C. Cody said he felt that the design guidelines and the ordinance has somewhat tied the board's hands. He didn't think rebuilding it identically might not be appropriate either. Both W. Jewell and C. Cody supported tabling the application to allow the applicant to work on the application.

K. McWilliams asked Building Inspector, Bryan Shaw, to come to the podium. K. McWilliams asked if it would be possible to not allow contractors who do work without permits to renew their license with the city. B. Shaw said he could look into it and it could be suggested to Council for review.

this to be on the record.

Roll Call:

J. Skillman Approved

R. Rodgers Approved

Page 3
Historic District Board of Review
August 25, 2025

C. Cody Approved

The motion was approved.

W. Jewell asked again for public comment. B. Haley read a written comment submitted by Happy Smith prior to the meeting. In reference to the before and after pictures and the corbels that were originally on the chimney, she said "A corbel is a brick or masonry "bump-out" on a chimney. Corbels add to a chimney's structural integrity and add architectural character. Madison has amazing chimneys. They contribute to each buildings historic character. I think the loss of this chimney reduces these buildings historic character. This historic board has been very hesitant to ask owners to undo or redo work, because of hardship. But our community is facing a 'death a thousand cuts' — a noticeable loss of historic character. This building, 723-725, is a good example of this.

C. Cody asked R. Pettit again if he would like to table the application to come up with another idea besides rebuilding or not replacing the chimney.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move that the project at 723-725 W. Third St. be tabled until next month's meeting."

Seconded by J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams Approved

J. Skillman Denied

W. Jewell Approved

R. Rodgers Approved

C. Cody Approved

The motion to table the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved.

R. Pettit asked if he could rebuild it as it was now, to which C. Cody said yes. C. Cody made the following motion, "I move that if the applicant elects to reconstruct what was previously there, to approve that course of action with staff review."

Seconded by W. Jewell.

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams Approved

J. Skillman Denied

W. Jewell Approved

R. Rodgers Approved

C. Cody Approved

The motion was approved.

Page 4
Historic District Board of Review
August 25, 2025

3. Zach Zehron – C. of A. to demolish the house on the lot to make room for Royer Corp. trucks and manufacturing space.
Location: 843 East St. Zoned: Medium Density Residential (R-8)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Zach Zehron was present.

Z. Zehron specified that the request is to accommodate the swing of the trucks as they enter and exit the Royer docks, as East St. is narrow. R. Rodgers asked if he had submitted an application with zoning to have the property rezoned. Z. Zehron said he believed he had. R. Rodgers said that he thinks demolition of any building in the historic district sets a bad precedent, and the condition of this particular house is not bad enough to clearly warrant demolition. However, he said he could see Royer’s point of view and what they would be trying to accomplish.

W. Jewell asked if Royer would consider a privacy fence on the north side of the property to help separate the lot from her driveway, as she might not want to have the parking lot right up to her house. Z. Zehron said that the owner, Ms. Betty, is a lifelong supporter of Royer, and that he didn’t believe she would care, but he would be willing to consider it.

Scott Lynch, also associated with the project, asked if it would be possible to approve the application with a conditional approval subject to the outcome at the zoning meeting. C. Cody said that since the application is just for the demolition and not to rebuild anything on that lot, it should be fine to make a decision without waiting for zoning.

W. Jewell asked for public comment.

Bob Vonch said that Ms. Betty is his wife’s aunt. He said she might not want the privacy fence, as she loves Royer and worked there for several years. B. Shaw said he agreed with the idea to approve with conditions, as this project can help bring jobs into town.

C. Cody said that he thinks we need to take a closer look at Midcentury houses in town, even though they are not considered contributing to the district.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
32.0 Demolition	p. 116-117	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 32.0 Demolition p. 116-117 32.1 Choose demolition only as a last resort. Property owners of contributing buildings should design any replacement building to reflect the demolished building’s height, scale, massing, and location. Applicants will have a heavy burden to demonstrate to the HDBR that a replacement building deviating from these aspects is congruous with the Historic District. <i>R. Rodgers</i> – This doesn’t meet guidelines based on the current zoning. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree with Ryan that this does not meet the guidelines for demolition, but the extenuating circumstances leading to it being rezoned will make it appropriate and meet the guidelines. <i>C. Cody</i> – I agree. <i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree. <i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.

Page 5
Historic District Board of Review
August 25, 2025

W. Jewell asked for a motion. C. Cody made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison District Board of Review grant a conditional certificate of appropriateness for 843 East St., that condition being to follow through on the rezoning of the property."

Seconded by J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Denied
C. Cody	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

4. Bob Vorch – C. of A. to extend top floor living space by two feet, using the same windows and doors, and adding a new window to the east wall.
Location: 407 E. Vaughn Dr. Zoned: Open Space (OS)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Bob Vorch was present.

B. Vorch said that currently, that space is wasted, so he would like to incorporate it into the mail living area. He said he might have to slightly shorten the windows to accommodate the pitch, but for now plans to use the same windows.

K. McWilliams asked if B. Vorch had started work on the addition he was previously approved for. He said he had not, as his contractor was waiting for good weather since both roofs would need to come off. He said that they spend more time in the front where he is requesting to extend the room and might choose to not move forward with the back if he gets approved today.

W. Jewell asked for public comment.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
26.0 New Construction - Additions	p. 106-108	Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 26.0 New Construction – Additions p 106-108 26.1 Where possible, locate new additions at the rear so that they have a minimal impact on the façade and other primary elevation of the affected building or adjacent properties. 26.4 Additions should be constructed so that they can be removed from the original building in the future without irreversible damage to significant features. Additions should be set in at least one foot (1) to show a break between the original structure and the new addition. K. McWilliams– This project meets the guidelines. J. Skillman – I agree. C. Cody – I agree. R. Rodgers – I agree.

		W. Jewell - I agree.
--	--	----------------------

W. Jewell asked for a motion. C. Cody made the following motion, "I move that the Madison District Board of Review approve a certificate of appropriateness for 407 E. Vaughn Dr."

Seconded by J. Skillman

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
C. Cody	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

5. Findley Properties LLC – C. of A. to demolish the current house and rebuild in the same design with an addition.
Location: 111 E. Fourth St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley explained that, after conversations with the applicants and additional information received, the applicants requested to table the application.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. J. Skillman made the following motion, "I move that we table the application for 111 E. Fourth St. until next month's meeting."

Seconded by W. Jewell.

Roll Call:

K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
C. Cody	Approved

The motion to table the application was approved.

New/Old Business:

K. McWilliams asked if there were any updates about 420 Broadway St. with the Vacant and Abandoned Ordinance. B. Shaw said there were not.

Staff Report:

August 2025 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Justin McGillan	1126 W. Second St.	Removal of vinyl siding, replacing with LP Smart
Kimberly Mullins	773 Presbyterian Ave	Privacy fence
D. Joe Craig	1145 W. Second St.	Removal of vinyl siding, replacing with Hardie board
Robin Mingione	768 W. Third St.	Gutters, fascia and soffit replacement
Claude Rottet	820 Fillmore Aly.	Stairs to yard in rear
Tina Stambaugh	116 Jefferson St.	Aluminum fence in back and side yards

August 2024 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completed
Alexis Hartman	203 W Main St	sign	Yes
Charles Ricketts	707 W First St	fence	yes
Angela Stader	109 E Main St	sign	yes
Glen Spencer	313 East St	siding	yes
Larry Ikerd	120 E Second St	sign	yes
Heidi Geiges	710 E First St	fence	yes
Mark Prickett	126 West St	fence	yes
Maryanne Imes	420 Broadway St.	railing	yes

J. Skillman made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by C. Cody.

Meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW


William Jewell, Chairman


Brenna Haley, Historic Preservationist