

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

May 27, 2025

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the regularly scheduled meeting on Monday, May 27, 2025, at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. William Jewell presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams, Happy Smith, Chris Cody, Jared Anderson, Ryan Rodgers, and Jed Skillman. Also present was Brenna Haley – Historic Preservationist.

W. Jewell gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Haley will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. W. Jewell added that at the end of each application, the board will vote.

04/28/2025 Minutes:

W. Jewell asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on April 28, 2025, and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by J. Anderson.

Roll Call:

H. Smith	Approved
C. Cody	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

- 1. Tom McPherson – C. of A. to remove the rear addition and replace with a 8'x16' deck, extend the front porch across entire building front with steps on the side, extend roof to cover the deck, add French doors on side and back of building, and enlarge the front window.
Location: 123 Jefferson St. Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Haley explained that there was a staff request to table to application until after Zoning approval is granted. The McPhersons had agreed to the tabling prior to the meeting.

W. Jewell asked for a motion to table the application. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move we table the project at 123 Jefferson until the next meeting."

Seconded J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved

Page 2
Historic District Board of Review
May 27, 2025

- J. Skillman Approved
- W. Jewell Approved
- R. Rodgers Approved
- J. Anderson Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 2. Judy Staicer – C. of A. to replace the garage with a two-story garage.
Location: 518 E. Second St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Judy Staicer was present.

K. McWilliams asked if the Staicers had spoken to the neighbors across the alley from where the garage will be, as there are several homes facing the alley that would be able to see the new garage. J. Staicer confirmed that the neighbors are aware of the proposed change to the garage. K. McWilliams then asked why they wanted the new garage to be two stories. J. Staicer said she wants to use the upstairs as an art studio. K. McWilliams said he didn't think a two-story garage would be appropriate in this area, but he would be in favor of extending the garage sideways instead.

H. Smith asked if the Staicers would keep the accordion doors that are on the current garage or donate them for architectural salvage. The Staicers agreed.

C. Cody stated that he didn't have any issue with the two-story design. Instead, he was worried that extending the structure sideways would overwhelm the lot and the existing historic lot coverage. R. Rodgers asked if they knew what brand windows they planned to use. They had not yet decided. There was a brief discussion on materials and what kind of divisions would be used. J. Staicer said she would be fine with one over ones or six over sixes. Multiple board members agreed that six over six is the preferred option. J. Anderson asked if the siding as shown in the submitted elevations, depicting the siding on the lower level as thinner and the siding on the upper level as thicker, would be accurate. J. Staicer confirmed that it would be.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	p. 101-102	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings p. 101-102</i> <i>R. Rodgers – I think this meets all guidelines.</i> <i>C. Cody – I agree.</i> <i>J. Skillman – I agree.</i> <i>K. McWilliams – I agree.</i> <i>J. Anderson – I agree.</i> <i>H. Smith – I agree.</i> <i>W. Jewell – I agree.</i>

W. Jewell asked for a motion. H. Smith made the following motion, "I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Robert and Judy Staicer at 518 E. Second St for the proposed two-story garage with windows with six over six muntins."

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Bill Combs behalf of James and Linda Edwards – C. of A. to replace shed damaged in storm with a new pre-fab shed.
Location: 841 W. Third St. Zoned: Medium Density Residential (R-8)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. James Edwards was present.

J. Edwards explained that the shed is where he keeps his tools, and that the original one on that site was damaged beyond repair during the storm a few weeks prior. He said that the replacement shed would be built by Southern Indiana Buildings, and it would be a portable garage. Visually, it would match the other metal sheds on the street, including immediately next door. The need for a portable shed comes from the location of the sewer line on the property and needing to be able to move the shed to do maintenance work on the line. He also explained that the paint and roof colors would match that of the main house. It will have a nine-foot garage door, one man door, and one window, and it will be used to store the lawn mower, garbage cans, and tools.

W. Jewell asked if they had considered a standing seam metal roof and board and batten metal siding, like what was used on a similar garage on W. Second St. J. Edwards said it would be made of the same material as the shed right next door. Both H. Smith and R. Rodgers said that the biggest concern for them was the material, as it isn't approved for use downtown according to the guidelines. C. Cody asked about the difference in difficulty for moving an aluminum structure versus a wooden one, stating that it wouldn't be good to give impossible guidance based on the circumstances.

J. Skillman asked why J. Edwards wasn't moving the location now that the original shed is gone, to get it away from the sewer line. If the location was moved, the structure could be permanent instead. J. Edwards said that to have it be permanent, the cost would increase substantially.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
------------------	---------------------	------------

24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	p. 101-102	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings p. 101-102</i> <i>J. Skillman</i> – This is a tough one. It meets about half of the criteria. I’m going to say it does not meet guidelines. <i>C. Cody</i> – I have a little bit less heartache about the materials because it is a modern garage and should be differentiated from the new, and I understand the unique constraints of the location over the sewer line. I’m thinking that there may be enough here to support approval and meet the guidelines. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I think it meets the guidelines. <i>J. Anderson</i> – I’m not sure this meets the guidelines. I think it boils down to the materials. <i>R. Rodgers</i> – I’m fine with the design, but my concerns are the materials. <i>H. Smith</i> – I think this might be a place where we can allow an exception to the guidelines. <i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.
--------------------------------------	------------	---

W. Jewell asked for a motion. C. Cody made the following motion, “I move that the Madison District Board of Review approve the application for 841 W. Third St. for the proposed project.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Denied
J. Anderson	Denied

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 4. Susan Morrison – C. of A. to replace carport damaged in storm, with the same dimensions on the original concrete pad, with a small enclosure for storage at the back with one door.
Location: 308 Madison St. Zoned: Medium Density Residential (R-8)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Susan Morrison was present.

J. Anderson noted that the application indicated that the original garage was metal. He thanked S. Morrison for choosing to replace it with a wooden structure.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	p. 101-102	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings p. 101-102 <i>H. Smith</i> – This seems to meet all guidelines. <i>C. Cody</i> – I agree. <i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>J. Anderson</i> – I agree. <i>R. Rodgers</i> – I agree. <i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Susan Morrison for her project at 308 Madison St.”

Seconded J. Anderson.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

5. Tim Godward – C. of A. to construct a new shed under the fire stairs, and to replace side windows with glass block.
Location: 408 Mulberry St. Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Tim Godward was present.

T. Godward said that he had been aware of some questions about the appropriateness of the glass block, and that he was open to suggestions and input. J. Anderson asked if he had considered an aluminum clad window with frosted glass for privacy. T. Godward said it was less about privacy and more about security. The windows are too high to see out of, and the glass block would add some structure and security while also allowing light in. J. Anderson said he had concerns over the glass block due to the time period the structure is from. Glass block was not commonly used at the time of the building's construction.

J. Skillman asked if he would consider using metal bars on the windows for security, rather than the glass block replacements. T. Godward agreed to the idea of metal bars.

C. Cody asked if T. Godward was pursuing the federal historic rehabilitation tax credit. T. Godward said he was not currently, but he would be happy to try and take advantage of that if funds are available. R. Rodgers asked if the roof of the shed would be the deck for the fire stairs, or if they would be two different structures. T. Godward said they would be two separate structures.

W. Jewell asked for public comment. Joe Godward asked if they might consider a compromise where the bars are used on the north side of the structure where it will be visible in the alley and the glass block is used on the south side. J. Skillman said that he noticed during his walk around the number of windows on the south side. He suggested doing the glass block in the last two windows but keeping the glass in the first window for the ambiance of the old building.

K. McWilliams asked if T. Godward has discussed the fire stairs with the building inspector, Bryan Shaw. T. Godward confirmed that he has, and that he is working with a vendor to finalize the details.

Link Luddington came up for public comment. He also mentioned the federal tax credit program and warned T. Godward that the HDBR's approval will not have any bearing on what the Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology at the state level, nor the Nation Park Service on the national level will approve for tax credits, therefore he should wait to do any work until after the plans have been evaluated by the appropriate divisions.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	p. 101-102	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings p. 101-102</i> <i>K. McWilliams – This meets the guidelines.</i> <i>C. Cody – I agree, with the clarification that you keep all historic windows.</i> <i>J. Skillman – I agree.</i> <i>J. Anderson – I agree, but I am still a little hesitant about the glass block in the windows that aren't there.</i> <i>R. Rodgers – I agree.</i> <i>H. Smith – I agree.</i> <i>W. Jewell – I agree.</i>

W. Jewell asked for a motion. R. Rodgers made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Tim Godward for the project at 408.Mulberry St.”

Seconded by H. Smith.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved

Page 7
Historic District Board of Review
May 27, 2025

J. Anderson Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 6. David Fischmer – C. of A. brick up two openings on alley side.
Location: 412 Broadway St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley explained that this application must be tabled for new designs to be presented.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move that we table the project at 412 Broadway St. from David Fischmer.

Seconded by J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to table was approved.

New/Old Business:

H. Smith presented her proposed changes to the Rules and Procedures. B. Haley clarified that nothing would be voted on during this meeting.

H. Smith said that all historic windows used to have to be seen by the board before any replacement could take place. During COVID, the procedure was changed to speed up the approval process. She expressed concern with the number of windows being replaced in town.

She went on to say that the current procedure allows for staff to approve all windows if the owner is willing to use guidelines-approved windows for replacement. H. Smith is proposing that any historic wood window replacement come before the board for approval, rather than allowing for staff approval.

K. McWilliams said that it was his motion to give these powers over to staff as a permanent change. It was due in part to make the process easier, and to reduce the animus against the board.

B. Haley presented the measured drawings for the garage at 1030 Park Ave. for review. The board agreed that Robin Mingione would not need to return to the board for additional approvals.

L. Luddington rose the issue of lack of consistency with approvals, specifically in relation to the metal shed discussed during this meeting. He said that he can think of at least three very prominent examples of metal pole barns in town that have been approved by the board in recent years. C. Cody explained

that there will always be an element of judgement going into the decisions, and those are on a case-by-case basis.

Staff Report:

May 2025 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Shannon Waggoner	402 E. Main St.	windows
Historic Madison, Inc.	120 W. Third St.	fence
Susan Eckert	611 W. Second St.	windows

May 2024 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completed
Jae Wood	112 E Main St	Sign	yes
Springdale Cemetery	602 W Fifth St	Doors; storm windows; gutters	yes
Children's Advocacy Center of Southeast Indiana	601 West St	sign	yes

J. Skillman made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by H. Smith.

Meeting adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW


William Jewell, Chairman


Brenna Haley, Historic Preservationist