

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

April 28, 2025

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the regularly scheduled meeting on Monday, March 24, 2025, at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. William Jewell presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams, Happy Smith, Chris Cody, Jared Anderson, Ryan Rodgers, and Jed Skillman. Also present was Brenna Haley – Historic Preservationist and Bryan Shaw – Building Inspector.

W. Jewell gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Haley will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. W. Jewell added that at the end of each application, the board will vote.

03/24/2025 Minutes:

W. Jewell asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on March 24, 2025, and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

H. Smith	Approved
C. Cody	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Considering former chair Mike Pittman's resignation the previous month, William Jewell has taken over as chair. This also required a new election for a vice chair to take place.

J. Anderson moved to elect Chris Cody as vice chair. Seconded by H. Smith.

Roll Call:

H. Smith	Approved
C. Cody	Abstained
K. McWilliams	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to elect C. Cody as vice chair was approved.

Applications:

Page 2
Historic District Board of Review
April 28, 2025

1. Tom Pritchard – C. of A. to install a 14'x32' pre-built shed in backyard for use as a woodworking shop, and to build a 20'x20' two-car garage on the west side of the home.
Location: 822 ½ W. Third St. Zoned: Medium Density Residential (R-8)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Tom Pritchard was present.

H. Smith asked what he would use the workshop for. T. Pritchard explained that it would be used for his wood carving hobby, as well as to store their golf cart. H. Smith asked if he had discussed the plans for the new garage with his neighbors. T. Pritchard confirmed that he had.

R. Rodgers asked if T. Pritchard was aware of the HDBR guidelines while applying. T. Pritchard said he was not completely aware, but he was familiar. According to the guidelines, accessory buildings are supposed to have a one third setback from the front of the house. In this project's case, that would not be possible, due to the shape of the house and the size of the lot.

C. Cody asked if T. Pritchard had considered rotating the garage 90 degrees to have the gabled end match the main house. He also suggested a more squared off look to be more time-period appropriate in appearance when compared to the house.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	p. 101-102	<p><i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 24.0 New Construction – Outbuildings p. 101-102</p> <p>24.2 Site new garages and accessory buildings appropriately on the lot. Locate detached new garages and outbuildings to the rear of a dwelling or set back from the side elevations. Attached garages and accessory buildings should be set back from the front façade of the primary dwelling at least one-third of the total depth of the dwelling.</p> <p><i>R. Rodgers</i> – I found that this doesn't meet 24.2 with the one-third setback, but the nature of the lot doesn't allow a building that would be the appropriate size to be able to set back that distance. So, in my opinion, it conforms because of the limitations.</p> <p><i>C. Cody</i> – I agree, though I would like to suggest that you study the rotation of the garage to have the gable end match the context and the windows.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree with Ryan for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>H. Smith</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Anderson</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.</p>

W. Jewell asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review approve the application for 822 ½ W. Third St."

Seconded by W. Jewell.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved

Page 3
Historic District Board of Review
April 28, 2025

J. Skillman Approved

W. Jewell Approved

R. Rodgers Approved

J. Anderson Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

2. Janeen Wise – C. of A. to build a two-story addition with a garage and bedroom/utility room.
Location: 1014 W. First St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. David Wise was present.

D. Wise said that they plan to make the addition match the existing structure as much as possible, so it won't stick out too much. He plans to match the stone look that is on the existing structure.

J. Skillman said that since the structure is non-contributing, he doesn't have any issues with it. He did request that they consider using half-round galvanized gutters to visually match historic gutters.

H. Smith asked about the stone D. Wise plans to use. He said it would be coming from a quarry out of Southern Indiana and would be a similar look to what is already there.

K. McWilliams said that the guidelines talk about not making additions taller than the original house, but this one can be an exception since it is a non-contributing structure.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Additions	p. 106-108	<p><i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 26.0 New Construction - Additions p. 106-108</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – We don't normally allow any additions to be taller than the main structure, but since this is non-contributing, this meets the guidelines.</p> <p><i>C. Cody</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>R. Rodgers</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Anderson</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>H. Smith</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.</p>

W. Jewell asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to their Wises for their project at 1014 W. First St."

Seconded by J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

C. Cody
Approved

H. Smith
Approved

Page 4
Historic District Board of Review
April 28, 2025

K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Robin Mingione – C. of A. to build a garage on the vacant lot adjacent to the house, and replace and enclose rear second and third floor decks together.
Location: 1030 Park Ave. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Robin Mingione was present.

K. McWilliams asked about the east side of the structure and how it has changed on the plans. R. Mingione confirmed that it will be a solid wall, rather than a wall of windows. She said that they decided to just do wood support beams rather than the steel, since it seemed like the board had problems with the steel after the last meeting. The board said that they would not be opposed to steel.

J. Skillman asked if there would any windows on the east side. R. Mingione said she would not be opposed to adding some transom windows to let in light, depending on the stair placement. H. Smith stated her appreciation for the Mingiones taking on the project, and the plans to replace the portico in the front.

J. Skillman suggested putting a fireplace in the new addition. R. Mingione said she plans to restore the fireplaces in every room.

R. Mingione said that there were issues with the garage during the last meeting. She will be unable to provide proper heights and measurements until after the work the city is doing on First St. is finished. She said it would be a poured concrete structure with a stone façade, but the heights could not be confirmed yet.

C. Cody asked if there could be a conditional approval for the garage. He suggested doing a conceptual approval that would be supplemented with the drawings and measurements once available. B. Haley confirmed that would be fine.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Additions	p. 106-108	<p>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 26.0 New Construction - Additions p. 106-108</p> <p>H. Smith – I believe this meets the guidelines. K. McWilliams – I agree. C. Cody – I agree. J. Skillman – I agree. R. Rodgers – I love what you’re doing with the design, but without elevations, I can’t approve it, so I disagree. J. Anderson – I agree. W. Jewell – I agree.</p>

Page 5
Historic District Board of Review
April 28, 2025

W. Jewell asked for a motion. H. Smith made the following motion, "I move that the Madison District Board of Review approve the application for 1030 Park Ave. for the rear deck addition to be built with either wood or steel as shown in the plans, and a conceptual approval for the garage with the requirement of elevations submitted to staff and board for review."

Seconded by J. Anderson.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

4. Tom McPherson – C. of A. to remove the rear addition and replace with a 8x16' deck, extend the front porch across entire building front with steps on the side, extend roof to cover the deck, add French doors on side and back of building, and enlarge the front window.
Location: 123 Jefferson St. Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Haley explained that there was a staff request to table to application until after Zoning approval is granted. The McPhersons had agreed to the tabling prior to the meeting.

W. Jewell asked for a motion to table the application. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "I move we table the project at 123 Jefferson until the next meeting."

Seconded J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to table was approved.

5. Tom McPherson – C. of A. cover deck on front, back, and side with a roof.
Location: 901 W. First St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Tom McPherson was present.

T. McPherson explained that the roofing material will be shingles just like the rest of the roof, and the construction will be wood. J. Skillman asked if the roof might be cutting the amount of light entering the house. T. McPherson agreed that it would, but that the house would still get adequate light.

H. Smith asked about the plans for the front. T. McPherson said that the roof overhang would be in the front as well. The posts on the porch will be stained, as well as the railing and the deck itself.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
14.0 Porches	p. 68-70	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 14.0 Porches p. 68-70 <i>J. Anderson</i> – This meets the guidelines. <i>H. Smith</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree. <i>R. Rodgers</i> – I agree. <i>C. Cody</i> – I agree. <i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. H. Smith made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Tom McPherson at 901 W. First St. for his new roof to cover his rear porch, side walkway, and his front porch.”

Seconded by J. Anderson,

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Page 7
Historic District Board of Review
April 28, 2025

6. Floyd Mathis – C. of A. replace wood window in kitchen with aluminum clad picture window.
Location: 757 Jefferson St. Zoned: Residential Medium Density (R-8)
- B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Floyd Mathis was present.
- F. Mathis explained that he wants to change the window to let in more light and get a better view. He provided a picture of the neighbor's picture window as an example of what he wants for his own house.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
14.0 Porches	p. 68-70	<p>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 14.0 Porches p. 68-70</p> <p>B. Haley said that, while the house is a contributing structure, it is not highly visible. All of the other windows and their light divisions will remain the same, so only the kitchen window will be changing, and thus might be worth an exception.</p> <p><i>J. Skillman</i> – In that regard, this meets the guidelines, sort of.</p> <p><i>C. Cody</i> – Guidelines are guidance and not absolutely hard line and definitive. This doesn't meet guidelines, but can be given an exception based on the site of the house and its context.</p> <p><i>H. Smith</i> – This picture window will not change much, so I agree that we can make an exception here.</p> <p><i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>R. Rodgers</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.</p>

W. Jewell asked for a motion. J. Skillman made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Floyd Mathis at 757 Jefferson St. for the proposed window replacement."

Seconded by H. Smith.

Roll Call:

- C. Cody Approved
- H. Smith Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- J. Skillman Approved
- W. Jewell Approved
- R. Rodgers Approved
- J. Anderson Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

7. Angela Lobb – C. of A. to replace utility shed that was damaged in storm.
Location: 213 Jefferson St. Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Angela Lobb was present.

A. Lobb explained that she wants to replace the shed that blew away and the shed that is deteriorating on the site with a larger shed, primarily for lawn mower and golf cart storage. K. McWilliams asked if both sheds would be replaced. A. Lobb confirmed that that was the plan. The doors would face the back porch and would be a bit taller than standard to accommodate the golf cart. K. McWilliams asked if it would be a kit. A. Lobb said it would be built by Yoder's Built Express, not a kit.

R. Rodgers asked if the roof would be gabled. A. Lobb confirmed that it would be gabled and those would be on the sides. The shed will be 12'x16' with built doors.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	p. 101-102	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings p. 101-102 <i>H. Smith</i> – This meets the guidelines. <i>J. Anderson</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree. <i>R. Rodgers</i> – I agree. <i>C. Cody</i> – I agree. <i>W. Jewell</i> – I agree.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. H. Smith made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Angela Lobb to erect a replacement temporary utility shed on the same site as the original at 213 Jefferson St."

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

8. Dale Nichols – C. of A. to add 7' of deck to accommodate camper and add view of river and street.
Location: 308 Vernon St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)
- B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Dale Nichols was present.
- D. Nichols said that even though the drawing shows stairs, he isn't planning to do those right away and might want to change the design from a standard staircase to a spiral staircase. He also confirmed that the extension would be coming towards the street, not the side of the property.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
26.0 New Construction - Additions	p. 106-108	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 26.0 New Construction - Additions p. 106-108 R. Rodgers – This meets the guidelines. H. Smith – I agree. K. McWilliams – I agree. J. Skillman – I agree. J. Anderson – I agree. C. Cody – I agree. W. Jewell – I agree.

C. Cody asked if the motion could be made to approve either a spiral staircase or a staircase as pictured, to avoid making him come back before the board again. The board agreed.

W. Jewell asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to Dale Nichols for his project at 308 Vernon St. and including the option of a staircase or a spiral staircase in the future."

Seconded by J. Skillman.

Roll Call:

- C. Cody Approved
- H. Smith Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- J. Skillman Approved
- W. Jewell Approved
- R. Rodgers Approved
- J. Anderson Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project

Page 10
Historic District Board of Review
April 28, 2025

9. Glen Spencer – C. of A. to replace shed structure in rear.
Location: 313 East St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Haley showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Nathan Spencer was present.

H. Smith asked if there would be a garage door on the alley side. N. Spencer confirmed that there would be. There would be a garage door and a regular door on the structure.

R. Rodgers said that it would be hard to approve anything based on the lack of detail in the pictures provided and the lack of elevations.

J. Skillman asked if N. Spencer would be open to tabling. He agreed to table.

W. Jewell asked for a motion to table. J. Skillman made the following motion, “I move that we table the application for 313 East St. for Glen Spencer until next month.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

C. Cody	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved
W. Jewell	Approved
R. Rodgers	Approved
J. Anderson	Approved

The motion to table was approved.

New/Old Business:

H. Smith reminded the board that there would be a proposed change to the Rules and Procedures at the next meeting for window approvals.

Staff Report:

April 2025 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Art on Main	309 W. Main St.	sign
John & Melanie Harrell	204 East St.	replacement of siding with LP Smart, new storm doors, railing design change
Susan Jette	808 E Second St.	Railings on exterior stairs
Combs Construction	602 W. Main St.	Windows

Applicant	Address	COA	Completed
Michael Armstrong	1047 W Main St	fence	yes
Paul Lee	820 W Main St	Windows, doors, gutters, fences, porches, lighting, siding	in progress
David Jackson	915 W First St	siding	yes
Larry Ikerd	120 E Second St	Lighting, sign	yes
Kelly Knight	414 East St	fence	yes
Kelcey Gilbert	630 W Main St	sign	yes
Marci Smith	902 E First St	Porches, shutters	yes
Chris Heitz/Shianne James	317 Mulberry St	sign	yes
Keith Acree	213 E Second St	sign	yes

H. Smith made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by J. Skillman.
Meeting adjourned at 7:07 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW


William Jewell, Chairman


Brenna Haley, Historic Preservationist

