

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOAD OF REVIEW

Minutes

April 24, 2023

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a meeting on Monday, April 24, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Josh Wilber presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams (via Microsoft Teams; left the meeting at 5:53pm), Owen McCall, Sandy Palmer, Michael Zink, and Mike Pittman. Also present was Devon Sharpe – HDBR Attorney and Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

4/05/2023 Minutes:

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for April 5, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

S. Palmer moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman	Approved
J. Wilber	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Zink	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Robb & Marci Smith – C. of A. to build a 24’x24’ garage with 2 overhead doors, standard door, and window(s); materials to be finalized but will include either wood/ cement siding.

Location: **902 E. First St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Robb Smith was present.

R. Smith stated he wanted to put a garage where one previously stood on an existing concrete pad with a vehicle egress facing the alley. J. Wilber asked about the size of the concrete pad and R. Smith stated it was 24’x24’. C. Rogers asked about the driveway access in relation to the garage and R. Smith stated the driveway ran north/south but the garage would be on the south behind the home and would have the overhead doors facing the alley. J. Wilber and M. Pittman asked about building materials and R. Smith stated they would use Cementous siding, carriage style overhead doors, a steel standard door, and aluminum clad wood windows.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction		<i>M. Pittman</i> – The guidelines recommend new buildings should be compatible with the style, massing, height, and orientation of

– Accessory Buildings	<p>existing buildings and this is. The doors, windows, and other materials are in conformance.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>
-----------------------	--

M. Pittman asked for a motion. C. Rogers made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Robb and Marci Smith at 902 E. Second St. to build a 24’x24’ garage with the materials to be finalized but will include either wood or Cementous siding, aluminum clad wood window, steel door, and carriage style garage doors.”

Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
M. Zink	Approved
J. Wilber	Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

2. Jeremy McCloskey – C. of A. to install solar panels on the rear roof elevation.
Location: **815 E. First St.** Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Jeremy McCloskey was present.

J. McCloskey stated the solar panels would be installed on the rear flat roof elevation and that the roof was not readily visible from most angles, so they would not affect the historic character of the property. C. Rogers verified the panels would be installed on the rear roof. J. Wilber asked about the number of panels and J. McCloskey stated he was unsure and wanted HDBR approval first, but that the area was not large.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
29.0 New Construction – Energy Retrofits		<p><i>M. Zink</i> – The guidelines recommend solar panels be located in a place where they will not be readily visible, will not alter the historic character, and the hardware is not readily visible because it will be further away from the right of way. All of the conditions are met, so I find this project in conformance.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

Seconded by C. Rogers.

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

3. James Benham – C. of A. to increase the rear door opening from 34" to 36" to allow furniture to be moved in/out; this includes rebuilding the frame to fit & includes the storm door.

Zoned: Residential Medium-Density (R-8)

B. Peach noted the applicants wanted to add a gingerbread detail on the front of the structure so the application needed to be amended to reflect this change. J. Wilber asked what the new door materials would be and J. Benham stated they would be a fiberglass door with a glass and metal storm door. S. Palmer asked if the transoms were still in place and J. Benham stated it was and that it would be rebuilt to fit the new door opening.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
9.0 Doors & Entrances	59-61	<i>O. McCall</i> – Original doors & entrances should be retained but noted the existing door was non-historic, so the change was consistent. Original openings should be retained, but this change is keeping the details but making them 2” wider. The new storm door will allow for a better view of the new door. Gingerbread on the front of the home would be compatible and in conformance as well.
5.0 Architectural Elements	52-53	<i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree. <i>M. Zink</i> – I agree. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to James Benham for the proposed widening of the rear door and transom and to add gingerbread trim to the roofline of the front facade at 1103 W. Main.”

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

4. Devin Scudder – C. of A. to replace existing rear door on non-historic addition with a new glass & metal double door.

Zoned: Specialty District (SD)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. No representative was present after two callings of the application.

The application was tabled to the May 2023 meeting.

5. Becky Adkins – C. of A. to install fence along rear portions of east, west, & northern property lines; install door on western elevation; removal of siding & installation of stone masonry work along rear foundation edges to replace existing siding due to deterioration & infill issues.

Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach noted the application had been withdrawn per applicant request.

6. Joe Godward – C. of A. to replace existing windows on rear (south) and west side of home with 1/1 vinyl windows with aluminum trim; remove non-historic aluminum awnings.

Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. J. Godward was present.

J. Wilber asked what materials the existing windows were. J. Godward stated they were a combination of wood and metal but all were non-historic windows installed in the addition in about 1940. J. Godward also stated he wanted to remove the shutters and awnings. J. Wilber verified the new windows would be 1/1 and J. Godward agreed. J. Wilber asked what the other windows that would not be replaced were made of and J. Godward stated wood.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
6.0 Awnings	54-55	<i>C. Rogers</i> – Metal awnings are appropriate for a twentieth century building and you’re taking these off, so it is in

<p>18.0 Windows</p>	<p>82-86</p>	<p>conformance. Windows should be replaced in kind and only deteriorated elements should be replaced. Vinyl windows that do not replicate the historic windows may not be approvable. Snap-in muntins are not appropriate. This project is in conformance with the guidelines because the windows and awnings were not original.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.</p>
-------------------------	--------------	--

M. Pittman asked for a motion. C. Rogers made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Joe Godward at 513 W. Main St. to replace the existing windows on the rear and west side of home with 1/1 vinyl windows and remove the awnings.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

7. Devon Sharpe – C. of A. to add window on rear second story of home in new bathroom; window will be same size, shape, design as other window on same wall.

Location: **718 W. Main St.**

Zoned: Specialty District (SD)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Devon Sharpe was present.

D. Sharpe stated the new window will match the existing window as much as possible and that a screen would be installed on both the new and existing window so that they would visibly match.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
18.0 Windows	82-86	<p><i>S. Palmer</i> – This window will not have muntins, so those guidelines are not applicable. It is in conformance because of the overall size and design. The new window is not on a primary façade and it is not highly visible, so it meets all the guidelines.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

Seconded by C. Rogers.

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

Location: **921 W. First St.** Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

J. Wilber noted the roof addition would be slightly lower than the primary roof. R. Rogers explained that he wanted to keep this roof addition similar to others around town, so this was done intentionally. C. Rogers asked if the deck would be rebuilt and R. Rogers stated it would not but that there would be new footers installed to support the roof.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
26.0 New Construction - Additions	106-108	<p><i>M. Pittman</i> – New additions should be placed on the rear and this is. They should also have compatible rooflines and by lowering the roofline how you’ve done, it is. It is compatible with massing because many of the nearby homes have rear decks and porches with roofs. The project is in conformance.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. M. Pittman made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Ryan Rogers for the project as presented.”

Seconded by M. Zink.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

9. Ken & Linda Pettit – C. of A. to replace existing wood windows with aluminum clad wood windows of same size, shape, & design.
Location: **119 East St.** Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach explained the application was incomplete because the notification sign was not posted by the deadline.

Application tabled to May 22, 2023 meeting.

10. Bill & Susan Ohlendorf – C. of A. to replace existing flat roof over entrance with pitched roof; replace flat roof on garage with pitched roof; build addition to existing garage of approximately 6’3” (with option to do garage or carport); replace existing wood windows with aluminum clad windows (front window & some side/rear window sizes will change); replace front door.
Location: **407 W. Second St.** Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Bill & Susan Ohlendorf were present.

S. Ohlendorf stated she wanted to amend the application to extend the size of the existing garage. S. Ohlendorf stated the home originally was a shotgun and there were additions on both sides in addition to the garage that was added over time. B. Ohlendorf stated the additions were of poor quality. B. Ohlendorf stated he wanted to use wood siding to match the existing historic wood siding that was uncovered on the original structure.

C. Rogers asked about the front door replacement and S. Ohlendorf stated the new door was a historic door. J. Wilber asked about the window replacement and S. Ohlendorf stated all of the windows would be replaced with some of the sizes changing. J. Wilber asked about the condition of the existing wood windows and B. Ohlendorf stated the existing windows were severely deteriorated or missing.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
3.0 Materials – Wood Siding & Singles	44-48	M. Zink – The installation of wood siding to match the historic siding is in conformance. The replacement of the front door with a period-correct door is also in conformance. The roof forms you are proposing are in conformance and more appropriate for not

J. Wilber asked for a motion. C. Rogers made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Bill and Susan Ohlendorf at 407 W. Second to replace existing flat roof over the entrance with a pitched roof, replace flat roof on garage with pitched roof, replace existing wood windows with aluminum clad windows, noting the front window & some side/rear window sizes will change, replace front door, and install wood siding.”

Roll Call:

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Angelo Zullo was present.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
23.0 New Construction – Outbuildings	101-108	<p><i>O. McCall</i> – New outbuildings should be based on evidence of any former buildings in massing, configuration, and placement and this is although the materials may differ some. This proposal is in conformance with the guidelines.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p>

Page 9
Historic District Board of Review
April 24, 2023

		J. Wilber – I agree.
--	--	----------------------

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Angelo and Mirta Zullo for the proposed construction of an outbuilding at the rear of 1218 W. Main St. to be 18’x20’.”

Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Old/New Business:

B. Peach also discussed awards for preservation month and the City’s plan for Preservation Month social media posts. J. Wilber asked HDBR members to get all nominations in by 5/1/2023.

B. Peach discussed the updated approval guidelines. J. Wilber asked for comment and discussion from the Board and noted none, so asked for a motion to approve. S. Palmer made a motion to approve the updated approval guidelines, “I move the HDBR approve the revised approval guidelines.”

Seconded by M. Zink.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Zink	Approved

The motion to approve the revised approval guidelines was approved.

Staff Report:

April 2023 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Julie Brown	623 Broadway Ave.	Replace existing replacement windows

		with 6/6 aluminum clad windows; replace existing replacement siding with Cementous siding
Central Holdings LLC	510 Mulberry	Replace 1 window with aluminum clad wood window of same size, design, & shape
John Kinman	814 E. Second St.	Install 42”x36”x10” sign flat on building; paint sign lettering on east face of building

April 2022 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Sarah Gray	312 W. Third St.	Install proposed stainless-steel chimney, new entrance, siding, vinyl windows, & porch on the rear/alley	Yes
Suzanne Hollinger	310 Broadway	Proposed new construction of a wood or Trex deck 27’x40’ in dimension, the removal of a non-historic window, & addition of a new steel or fiberglass door in the window opening	In progress
Jill Shaw	501 W. Main	Install wood entablature around door	Yes
HMI	304 W. Second St.	Install copper standing seam roof & gutters	Yes

S. Palmer made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by M. Zink.

Meeting adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Josh Wilber, Chairman

Brooke Peach
Historic Preservationist