

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOAD OF REVIEW

Minutes

February 24, 2020

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a regular meeting on Monday, February 24, 2020 at 5:30 p.m. in City Hall. Josh Wilber presided over the meeting with the following board members present: Ken McWilliams, Mike Pittman, Susan Schmidt, Owen McCall, Betsy Lyman and Thomas Stark. Also present: Brian Martin, Building Inspector; Devon Sharpe, attorney; and Nicole Schell, City Planner – Preservation Coordinator.

J. Wilber opened the meeting by introducing the new members Ken McWilliams and Mike Pittman. Each member gave a brief introduction. J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. Each applicant will be asked to sign the gold affidavit on the podium which states the required signage was up for the required amount of time. N. Schell will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

1/27/2020 Minutes:

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on January 27th and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes – seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
T. Stark	Approved
B. Lyman	Approved
S. Schmidt	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

New Applications:

1. Robert Haase (Heritage Trail Conservancy) – C. of A. to demolish existing structure to create greenspace.
Location: **904 ½ W Third St.** Zoned: Medium Density Residential (R-8)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicants and explained the changes proposed by the applicants. Bob Greene was present.

B. Greene expressed why this structure should be demolished and quoted a statement by Link Ludington which states that not everything can be saved and when changes do take place, we need to make sure they are for the better. B. Greene gave an history of this property and added that the family approached the Heritage Trail Conservancy about purchasing it. The future of this site will be a pocket park with benches and light posts. B. Greene stated the building could be entered but the interior is in very poor condition.

M. Pittman thanked B. Greene for his efforts. B. Lyman noted that the Building Inspector stated in his report that this property is in the flood plain and could not be built on. B. Greene stated they did not intend to build on this property. T. Stark asked about the asphalt. B. Greene stated he would defer to Tony Hammock who will be demolishing the structure. He believed it would be removed. B. Greene noted the board is voting to demolish the two structures on the property, the house and the accessory structure.

J. Wilber asked for questions from the audience.

Historic District Board of Review

February 24, 2020

J. Wilber asked for questions from the audience.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Lighting	33, 34	31 - 33	O. McCall – The guidelines on page 47 talk about replacing an historic fixture but there are none on this structure. I don’t think lighting is really part of the house because it can be easily changed, and I hope in the new guidelines it is removed. Since this is not a replacement, we cannot say this fixture isn’t appropriate because its new. The fixture is gas and very cool. I think this project is in line with the guidelines. S. Schmidt – I agree for the same reasons. B. Lyman – I agree for the same reasons. It looks like #4 says something about if modern light fixtures are desired then they should be compatible with historic materials. This application has done that. K. McWilliams – I agree for the same reasons. M. Pittman – I agree for the same reasons. T. Stark – I agree for the same reasons. J. Wilber – I agree for the same reasons.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion:

“I move that a COA be approved for 508 Jefferson Street.”

Motion was seconded M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- T. Stark Approved
- B. Lyman Approved
- S. Schmidt Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- M. Pittman Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

J. Wilber stated the COA was approved and the applicant could go ahead with the project pending the requisite permits were filed. J. Wilber stated the lighting should be installed by a licensed plumber.

Old Business:

N. Schell noted that she is working on receiving all the board comments on the staff review table. She hopes to have it out to the board for discussion at the next regular meeting. B. Lyman asked about the fence along West Street. N. Schell noted that did not receive staff approval and is working with staff at that facility to get it changed.

Page 4

Historic District Board of Review

February 24, 2020

Business – Staff Report:

Historic District Board of Review: Fast Track Applications

Applicant	Address	Date of Approval	Material
Jim Pruett	214-216 W Second St	2/6/2020	Restoration of front façade
Jim Pruett	214-216 W Second St	2/6/2020	3 ft Iron Fence
McWhiggins Wonder Emporium	220 W Main St	2/24/2020	2 Aluminum composite signs

Historic District Board of Review: 2019 COA Review

Applicant	Address	What Was Approved	Done According to COA?
Grey, Marcus and Ashley	944 Walnut St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demolish structure. 	Yes
MVP014 LLC	416 Presbyterian Ave.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demolish block building on lower lot. 	Not Started
Cox, Charles	841 W Main St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replace wood garage door with new wood garage door to match the original. 	Yes
Duckworth, Gary and Suzan	423 E Third St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Build a second story 5-ft x 18-ft porch on top of existing single story porch. Second story porch will match details on existing porch. Change second story window into doorway. 	Yes
CottageGreen LLC	615 Mulberry St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Place a 10-ft x 16-ft storage building behind house. 	Yes
CottageGreen LLC	613 Mulberry St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Brick in small window openings on the south facade. Chimney on rear addition will be removed. Replace first and second story windows with 6/6 wood windows. Replace basement windows with 2/2 windows with iron grids. Replace door with wood paneled door. Replace concrete on porches to create concrete landing and steps with wood railing and columns. 	In progress

Page 5

Historic District Board of Review

February 24, 2020

Applicant	Address	What Was Approved	Done According to COA?
McWilliams, Kenneth & Sally	315 Poplar St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace front door with four panel wood door. • Install new lighting. • Replace two non-original galley doors with wood and glass doors. • Build a 26-ft x 22-ft garage, a 10-ft x 13-ft 10-in breezeway, and a 5-ft 8-in x 14-ft 4-in addition. 	Yes
Cornerstone Society, Inc.	815 W Second St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Remove existing 32' x 5' front cement slab. Replace it with approximately 4' wide stone steps at each entrance. • Replace existing siding on sides of structure with either new wood siding or smooth LP Smart siding. • Replace the (2) windows on each side with wood windows, 6 over 6 true divided light. • Replace current damaged doors on both sides with period appropriate wood panel doors. • Remove existing 12' x 32' single story shed roof addition. Replace it with a wood frame 1 1/2 story 16' x 32' addition with a gable roof line. • Replace damaged metal roof with architectural shingles. • Remove chimneys and replace them with faux chimneys. • Add wood Siding and two out swinging front doors to existing shed. 	Not Started, Asking for extension

J. Wilber asked for a motion on the requested COA extension. M. Pittman made the following motion:

“I move that the COA be extended for one year.”

Motion was seconded K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved
O. McCall Approved
T. Stark Approved
B. Lyman Approved
S. Schmidt Approved
K. McWilliams Approved
M. Pittman Approved

Page 6

Historic District Board of Review

February 24, 2020

The motion to extend the Certificate of Appropriateness passed.

No further business to be brought before the board.

B. Lyman made the motion to adjourn - seconded by T. Stark.

Meeting adjourned at 6:03p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Josh Wilber, Chair

Nicole M Schell
City Planner – Preservation Coordinator